

## VERSE 59



### DISCIPLE CONVINCED OF EXISTENCE OF THE SOUL

#### LINK

- 1) The disciple, eager to gain knowledge, put forth arguments regarding the existence of the soul, which the Guru resolved with counter arguments backed by logic and evidence.
- 2) By deeply contemplating upon the solution received from the Guru, the disciple is convinced about its correctness. He says -

આત્માના અસ્તિત્વના, આપે કહ્યા પ્રકાર,  
સંભવ તેનો થયે છે, અંતર કાર્યે વિચાર. ૫૯

Atmana astitvana, Aape kahya prakar;  
Sambhav teno thay chhe, antar karye vichar. 59

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Atmana astitvana = (Regarding) the existence of the soul
- 2) Aape kahya prakar = Logic and examples explained by You
- 3) Sambhav teno thay chhe = Seems possible / is acceptable
- 4) Antar = Internally
- 5) Karye vichar = Contemplating upon / reflecting upon

#### SHORT MEANING

- By internally contemplating over the clarification given by You, regarding the existence of the soul,
- It seems possible.  
(He declares that he has been clearly convinced by it and the existence of the soul is acceptable to him.)

## VERSE 60



### SOUL IS NOT ETERNAL

(Disciple's Doubt - No. 1)

#### LINK

- 1) After getting convinced of the truth of the first proposition (fundamental truth) i.e. the soul exists,
- 2) The disciple proceeds to his doubts about the second proposition i.e. the soul is eternal.
- 3) In this verse 60, under the influence of the Charvaka philosophy, from the perspective of gross modification, expressing the impermanence of the soul, the disciple says -

---

બીજી શંકા થાય ત્યાં, અત્મા નહીં અવિનાશી,  
દેહ યોગથી ઉપજે, દેહ વિયોગે નાશી. ૬૦

Biji shanka thay tya, atma nahi avinash;  
Dehyogthi upje, dehviyoge nash. 60

---

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Biji shanka thay = Second doubt arises
  - 2) Tya = Now
  - 3) Atma nahi = Soul is not
  - 4) Avinash = Indestructible / eternal / immortal
  - 5) Dehyogthi upje = Takes birth with the union of the body
  - 6) Dehviyoge nash = Gets destroyed on the separation with the body
- 

#### SHORT MEANING

- Now arises the second doubt that the soul is not indestructible - immortal - eternal.
- It is created with the association of the body and is destroyed with the separation from the body.

(The disciple feels that the soul might be arising with the formation of the body and might be destroyed at the time of death.)

## VERSE 61

### SOUL IS MOMENTARY

(Disciple's Doubt - No. 2)

#### LINK

- 1) Having expressed to the Guru - his doubt regarding the indestructible nature of the soul, that rose under the influence of the Charvaka philosophy, said that it seems the nature of the soul is creation and destruction.
- 2) Disciple now presents an argument that has arisen under the influence of the Buddhist philosophy from the perspective of subtle modification of life like the states of anger etc. that change every moment therefore it is momentary.
- 3) The disciple influenced by the Buddhist doctrine of momentariness, says -

અથવા વસ્તુ ક્ષણિક છે, ક્ષણે ક્ષણે બદલાય,  
એ અનુભવથી પણ નહીં, આત્મા નિત્ય જાણે. ૬૧

Athva vastu kshanik chhe, kshane kshane paltay;  
E anubhavthi pan nahi, atma nitya janay. 61

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Athva = Or
- 2) Vastu kshanik chhe = Substance is transient
- 3) Kshane kshane paltay = (As it is seen) changing every moment
- 4) E anubhavthi pan = From this experience also
- 5) Nahi atma nitya janay = Soul is not known to be eternal

#### SHORT MEANING

- Or
- Substance is seen to undergo modifications every moment (keeps on changing every moment) and therefore all objects are momentary.
- Judging from experience too, the soul does not seem eternal.

## VERSE 62



### WHO IS THE KNOWER OF THE CREATION AND DESTRUCTION OF THE SOUL

(True Teacher's Reply for Doubt No. 1)

#### LINK

- 1) The Guru now provides a methodical - impactful - firm - wisdom-filled solution to the logical arguments arising due to the disciple's sequential thought process.
- 2) As a result of this, 'Soul is eternal' the second fundamental of samyagdarshan is proven to the disciple.
- 3) Establishing through different evidences like logic, experience and inference, the Guru completely uproots the doubt in the disciple's mind.
- 4) In verse 62 - 63, the Guru discusses whether there is any witness (knower) of the event of the soul's creation and destruction. The Guru says -

---

દેહ મત્ર સંયોગ છે, વલિ જડ, રૂપી દ્રશ્ય,  
ચેતના ઉત્પત્તિ લય, કોના અનુભવ વશ્ય? ૬૨

Deh matra sanyog chhe, vali jad roopi drashya;  
Chetanna utpatti laya, kona anubhav vashya? 62

---

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Deh matra sanyog chhe = Body is formed by union of non-living matter
  - 2) Vali jad, roopi, drashya = Also lifeless, with form, visible
  - 3) Chetanna utpatti laya = (Then) creation and destruction of soul
  - 4) Kona anubhav vashya? = Depends upon whose experience? (observation)
- 

#### SHORT MEANING

- The body is formed by union of non-living matter and it is only in temporary association with the soul.
- It is non-living, with form and visible.
- Then who experiences i.e. who can have the knowledge of the creation and destruction of the soul. (As the body is without consciousness how and who knows that the soul is created and destroyed?)

## VERSE 63



### KNOWER HAS TO BE SEPARATE FROM THE SOUL

#### LINK

- 1) When contemplating upon the answer to the question posed in verse 62, there seems 2 possible options -
  - a) If it is said - that such experience depends on the body, then it is not possible, as the body does not have the attribute of knowingness - therefore cannot know the creation - destruction of the soul.
- 2) In verse 62 itself the Guru negated the first option as the body is inanimate - has a form - is visible.
- 3) Now in verse 63, the Guru gives the solution to the second option -
  - b) Showing how the option that the creation and destruction of the soul is known by consciousness is not possible, the Guru says -

જેના અનુભવવશ્યે એ, ઉત્પન્ન લયનું જ્ઞાન,  
તે તેથી જુદા વિના, થાય ના કેમે બધા. ૬૩

Jena anubhav vashya e, utpann layanu jnan;  
Te tethi juda vina, thay na keme bhan. 63

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Jena anubhav vashya e = Upon whom the experience of
- 2) Utpann layanu jnan = Creation and destruction of the soul
- 3) Te tethi juda vina = Has to be separate from it
- 4) Thay na keme bhan = To know it

#### SHORT MEANING

- One who claims to know the birth and death of the soul must be different from it.
- The knowledge of the emergence and extinction can in no way arise, unless the agency experiencing that knowledge is different from the object.



## VERSE 64



### SOUL NOT PRODUCED FROM ANY UNION

#### LINK

- 1) In verse 62 - 63, the Guru proved that no one can know the creation and destruction of the soul. Therefore, the argument that the soul is created and destroyed through association with the body, is not backed by experience.
- 2) Now through logical reasoning in verses 64 - 66, the Guru will show that the soul is uncreated and indestructible.
- 3) Resolving the disciple's probable doubt that the soul is also created (like the body) by some association the Guru says -

જે સંયોગો દેખિયે, તે તે અનુભવ-દ્રશ્ય;  
ઉપજે નહિ સંયોગથી, આત્મા નિત્ય પ્રત્યક્ષ. ૬૪

Je sanyogo dekhiye, te te anubhav drashya;  
Upje nahi sanyogathi, atma nitya pratyaksh. 64

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Je sanyogo dekhiye = Whatever combinations are seen
- 2) Te te anubhav drashya = Soul knows them
- 3) Upje nahi sanyogathi = Soul is not born through any combination and for that reason
- 4) Atma nitya pratyaksh = The soul is evidently eternal

#### SHORT MEANING

- Whatever unions or combinations of atoms are observed and experienced (known) by the soul.
- Reflecting on the nature of these combinations, we find none is competent to create a soul.
- The soul is not observed to arise from the union of the elements of the body (combination of atoms).
- Therefore (evidently) the soul is eternal and present at all times.

## VERSE 65



### SUCH EXPERIENCE HAS NEVER BEEN POSSIBLE

#### LINK

- 1) The disciple's belief is that it is probable that the soul is created from inanimate body. It lasts as long as the body lasts and is destroyed when separated from the body.
- 2) The three earlier verses (62 - 64) were the introduction to the solution of this argument.
- 3) Now addressing the argument directly in this verse 65, the Guru says -

---

જાડથી ચેતન ઉપજે, ચેતનથી જાડ થાય,  
એવો અનુભવ કોને, ક્યારે કદી ન થાય. ૬૫

Jadthi chetan upje, chetanthi jad thay;  
Evo anubhav koine, kyare kadi na thay. 65

---

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Jadthi chetan upje = Consciousness arising from matter
  - 2) Chetanthi jad thay = Or matter arising from consciousness
  - 3) Evo anubhav koine = Such experience to anyone
  - 4) Kyare kadi na thay = Has never been possible
- 

#### SHORT MEANING

- No one has ever experienced.
  - Consciousness getting created from non-conscious matter.
  - And non-conscious matter getting created from consciousness.
- (This experience has never been possible to anyone, anywhere, any time.)

## VERSE 66



### SOUL IS DEFINITELY ETERNAL

#### LINK

- 1) By contemplating upon every association, no such association is known from which the soul can be created. The soul is the knower of the association and not the product of any association.
- 2) Therefore, the Guru showed the fallacy of believing that the soul, which is not the product of association and is of the nature of knowingness, can be created from inanimate substance.
- 3) In verse 64 - 65, He established that the soul is uncreated. Now in this verse 66, the Guru establishes the soul's indestructibility. He says -

---

કોઈ સંયોગથી નહીં, જેની ઉત્પત્તિ થઈ,  
નાશ ન તેનો કોઈયથી, તેથી નિત્ય સદાય. ૬૬

Koi sanyogothi nahi, jeni utpatti thay;  
Nash na teno koima, tethi nitya saday. 66

---

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Koi sanyogothi nahi = That which - by any union
  - 2) Jeni utpatti thay = Cannot be created
  - 3) Nash na teno koima = Cannot be destroyed into anything else
  - 4) Tethi nitya saday = Therefore soul is always (definitely) eternal
- 

#### SHORT MEANING

- That which cannot be created by any kind of union or combination of atoms or things,
- Cannot be destroyed into anything else by the cessation of contact or disintegration of atoms.
- According to the universal law one that is created can be destroyed; but the soul is not created so cannot be destroyed.
- Therefore, it is eternal.  
(Souls cannot be created by combination of objects or destroyed by separation of objects. Thus it is eternal.)



## VERSE 67



### TENDENCIES PROVE THE ETERNITY OF THE SOUL

#### LINK

- 1) By deeply contemplating upon the Guru's solution regarding the eternal nature of the soul, the disciple feels that his argument was baseless.
- 2) In this verse 67, to strengthen the faith of his, the Guru proves the eternal nature of the soul through inference. Giving an authentic evidence to prove the soul is not created and destroyed with the creation and destruction of the body, the Guru says -

ક્રોધાદિ તરતમ્યતા, સર્પાદિકની માંહે,  
પૂર્વજાન્મા સંસ્કાર તે, જીવ નિત્યતા ત્યાં. ૬૭

Krodhadi tartamyata, sarpadikni mai;  
Poorvajanma sanskar te, jiva nityata tyay. 67

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Krodhadi tartamyata = Variation in tendencies of anger etc.
- 2) Sarpadikni mai = Are found in snake etc.
- 3) Poorvajanma sanskar te = Due to the orientations of past lives
- 4) Jiva nityata tyay = (This proves) for this reason also the soul is eternal

#### SHORT MEANING

- There is a burst of anger and other passions in snakes etc. from their very birth,
- This is due to the tendencies acquired by them from previous births.
- This proves the eternity of the soul.

## VERSE 68



### NATURE OF A SUBSTANCE - THE SOUL

#### LINK

- 1) In verse 61, the disciple had raised the doubt that the object is seen to undergo modification every moment, therefore all objects are momentary.
- 2) Looking at the feelings of anger etc., which change every moment, the disciple feels that the soul is not eternal, rather it's momentary.
- 3) Explaining the true nature of the soul, the Guru says -

આત્મા દ્રવ્યે નિત્ય ચ્હે, પાર્યાયે પાલ્તાય,  
બાલદી વાય ત્રાન્યાનુ, જ્ઞાન એકને થાય. ૬૮

Atma dravye nitya chhe, paryaye paltay;  
Baladi vay tranyanu, jnan ekne thay. 68

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Atma = The soul
- 2) Dravye nitya chhe = As a substance is eternal (unchanging)
- 3) Paryaye paltay = But its states continue to change
- 4) Baladi vay tranyanu = Childhood etc. three stages
- 5) Jnan ekne thay = Knowledge of all three stages are known by the same entity

#### SHORT MEANING

- The soul,
- As a substance is eternal, unchanging.
- But its states continue to change.
- Childhood, adulthood, old age are different stages of life, but the eternal soul, which has the knowledge of all the three stages, is the same throughout.

## VERSE 69



### NARRATOR OF MOMENTARINESS IS NOT MOMENTARY

#### LINK

- 1) Although every substance has the qualities of permanence and impermanence, there are some who accept the existence of the soul, and yet believe that it is absolutely impermanent, created and destroyed every moment.
- 2) Logically proving the incorrectness of their belief, explaining how it is not possible for the soul to have momentary existence; the Guru says -

અથવા જ્ઞાન ક્ષણિકનું, જે જાણી વદનાર,  
વદનારો તે ક્ષણિક નહિ, કર અનુભવ નિર્ધાર. ૬૯

Athva jnan kshaniknu, je jani vadnar;  
Vadnaro te kshanik nahi, kar anubhav nirdhar. 69

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Athva = Or
- 2) Jnan kshaniknu = Knowledge of momentariness
- 3) Je jani = The one who knows
- 4) Vadnar = And speaks / narrates
- 5) Vadnaro te = Speaker / narrator
- 6) Kshanik nahi = Is not momentary
- 7) Kar anubhav nirdhar = Ascertain by your own experience

#### SHORT MEANING

- Or,
- The narrator (speaker) who has the knowledge of momentary states, is not momentary himself.  
(The speaker who knows and speaks about momentariness is not momentary, for the speaker must be continuous - to know and to speak.)
- Ascertain this by your own experience (observation).

## VERSE 70



### NO SUBSTANCE IS ENTIRELY DESTROYED

#### LINK

- 1) The Guru imparted a logical understanding to the disciple establishing the eternal nature of the soul, from verse 62 till this concluding verse 70.
- 2) Of all the rational solutions given by the Guru, this concluding verse is the pinnacle.
- 3) In this verse 70, drawing the disciple's attention to the universal law of conservation, accepted by science, applicable to every substance, the Guru skillfully proves that the soul is eternal.
- 4) Rebutting the false belief of the Buddhist philosophy of momentariness, and establishing the existence of the soul in all three periods of time, in this verse the Guru says -

ક્યારે કોઈ વસ્તુને, કેવળ હોય ના નાશ,  
ચેતન પમેય નાશ તો, કેમ ભાલે તપસ. ૭૦

Kyare koi vastuno, keval hoy na nash;  
Chetan pamey nash to, kema bhaley tapas. 70

#### WORD TO WORD MEANING

- 1) Kyare koi vastuno = Never any substance
- 2) Keval hoy na nash = Can be destroyed completely
- 3) Chetan pamey nash to = If the soul is destroyed
- 4) Kema bhaley tapas = Find in what it is transmuted / converted to

#### SHORT MEANING

- Never any substance can be entirely destroyed (into nothing).
- Examine, if the soul is destroyed, what will it get converted into? (If consciousness is destroyed, find in what it is transmuted.)